Students in Charge: Self-Assessment And Learning To Learn
Jaclyn Zubrzycki
Contributing writer, Education Week

Follow Jackie on Twitter: @JZubrzycki
Students in Charge: Self-Assessment and Learning to Learn

Expert Presenters:

Heidi Andrade, associate professor, School of Education, University at Albany, State University of New York

Angela Fremont-Appel, art teacher, New York City Public Schools

Related Article:
Students ‘Self-Assess’ Their Way to Learning
An on-demand archive of this webinar will be available at www.edweek.org/go/webinar in less than 24 hrs.
Formative Self-Assessment Promotes Learning, and Students Love It

Heidi Andrade, Ed.D.
University at Albany—SUNY
Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, SOE
Associate Professor, Educational Psychology & Methodology

School of Education
THE WORLD WITHIN REACH
The Dual Purposes of Assessment

A balanced assessment system serves the purposes of learning and the purposes of accountability.
Common Misconceptions About Self-Assessment

1. Student self-assessment is pointless because they just give themselves As.

2. Self-generated feedback is a waste of time because students won’t revise their work anyway.
A Definition of Self-Assessment

- Self-assessment is *not* a matter of determining one’s own grade.

- It is a process of formative assessment during which students reflect on the quality of their work and their learning, judge the degree to which they reflect the standards for it, identify strengths and weaknesses, and revise.

- Or, criteria-referenced feedback for oneself from oneself.
This is not self-assessment

End of the Week Assessment

Name: Angelina

Date: Sept 21, 1999

Please answer the questions.

1. How did you do this week?

   I did a good job and I did a lot of work.

2. What did you do best? Why? Do you have an example?

   Reading, math, cursive.

3. What do you need to work on? Why? Do you have an example?

   I don't need help on nothing.
Key Characteristics of Effective Self-Assessment

- Clearly articulated goals, targets, or criteria.
- Constructive reflection on strengths, weaknesses, and possible improvements.
- Time for revision *before* getting teacher feedback.
- Anonymity?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideas &amp; Content</strong></td>
<td><strong>The paper clearly states an opinion and gives 3 clear, detailed reasons in support of it.</strong></td>
<td><strong>An opinion is given. One reason may be unclear or lack detail.</strong></td>
<td><strong>An opinion is given. The reasons given tend to be weak or inaccurate.</strong></td>
<td><strong>The opinion and support for it is buried, confused and/or unclear.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td><strong>The paper has an interesting beginning, developed middle and satisfying conclusion in an order that makes sense. Paragraphs are indented, have topic and closing sentences, and main ideas.</strong></td>
<td><strong>The paper has a beginning, middle and end in an order that makes sense. Paragraphs are indented; some have topic and closing sentences.</strong></td>
<td><strong>The paper has an attempt at a beginning &amp;/or ending. Some ideas may seem out of order. Some problems with paragraphs.</strong></td>
<td><strong>There is no real beginning or ending. The ideas seem loosely strung together. No paragraph formatting.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Voice &amp; Tone</strong></td>
<td>....</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
N = 100

TOTAL ESSAY SCORE

EXPERIMENTAL CONDITION

Comparison

Treatment
Effect Sizes for Rubric-referenced Self-assessment of Writing

- On average, students in the treatment earned a low B, while those in the comparison earned a high C.
- Elementary school, grades 3-4
  - Cohen’s $d = .87$
- Middle school, grades 5-7
  - Cohen’s $d = .66$
Results of Rubric-Referenced Self-Assessment by Criteria

- The treatment was associated with higher scores on all criteria—including Ideas and Voice—except Conventions, which was not self-assessed.

- This finding undermines critiques of rubric use that claim it promotes weak writing by focusing only on the most quantifiable and least important qualities of writing.
Self-Assessment in Practice

- Jason Rondinelli and Emily Maddy’s 7th grade students
- Brooklyn, NY
- Task: an essay about art
- [www.studentsatthecenter.org/resources/student-centered-assessment-video-suite](http://www.studentsatthecenter.org/resources/student-centered-assessment-video-suite) • Start at 1:35

Artful Learning Communities: Assessing Learning in the Arts, funded by a USDOE PDAE (Professional Development for Arts Educators) grant, the NYC Department of Education (District 20), and ArtsConnection.
Conclusion

- Under the right conditions, students can be very useful sources of feedback for themselves.

- The right conditions include:
  - Clear criteria
  - A constructive process of critique
  - Time for revision
  - Anonymity? Or at least NOT counting toward a grade


Self-assessment in my Art Studio

Angela Fremont
PS 69  Vincent D. Grippo School
Brooklyn, NY
Every time the brush stops, the artist self-assesses.
How do you begin to self assess?

Start with clear criteria
How can criteria support self-assessment?

Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Painting</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>Yes, but</th>
<th>No, but</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shape (bottle)</td>
<td>All Shapes are observed attention to scale</td>
<td>Shapes are observed, but some need more attention to detail or scale</td>
<td>Loosely observed shapes, somewhat representative of actual shapes</td>
<td>No observation of shapes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background (contrast)</td>
<td>Color is lighter or darker than shape</td>
<td>Color similar but you can see the shape</td>
<td>Color too closely matches with shape color</td>
<td>Cannot see the difference between the background and the shape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Color may not touch some edges</td>
<td>Some paper visible</td>
<td>Colors not touching some paper visible</td>
<td>Lots of paper is visible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shadow</td>
<td>All shapes have shadow</td>
<td>Most shapes do not have shadow</td>
<td>No shadow or too light to see</td>
<td>No gradation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gradation is darker than shape</td>
<td>Gradation may not be evenly painted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edges of shadow are smooth</td>
<td>Edges may not be clear</td>
<td>Edges unclear</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What I need to do next?

[Student's response]

---

Landscape:

- Find big shapes by looking closely.
- All shapes are observed attention to scale.
- If the horizon is clear, I can see the sky and land.
- The land is interesting with lots of details.
- Gradation is interesting but could add more details.
- Edges of shadow are smooth.

What do I need to do next?

I need to add more details on my drawing.

[Student's response]

---

Art:

- Find big shapes by looking closely.
- All shapes are observed attention to scale.
- If the horizon is clear, I can see the sky and land.
- The land is interesting with lots of details.
- Gradation is interesting but could add more details.
- Edges of shadow are smooth.

What do I need to do next?

[Student's response]
Even young children can self-assess

• Kindergarten is a good beginning...
10/9/15 response

When I was drawing and then I looked at it, it looked like an actual person. Having clear criteria made my drawing not just the color of charcoal, it made it light and dark. The bangs I drew were on different sides which made the drawing different. I was also surprised that using charcoal was not easy. Next time I will draw bigger and try to focus on the big details.

10/9/15 reflections

medium: charcoal, chalk
as critical ingredients within composition form.

Contrast: having a clear criteria helped me because it made my drawing look better. It made it realistic. It also helped me focus.
How do you collect data from self assessment?

Yong Chang wrote:

“When I work the second time on my drawing I was surprised that my second one is better than the first one...Now I was drawing more bravely. The last time I wasn’t brave. I was surprised for my writing.”
Why is self assessment critical?

Art studio

On the second day I felt surprised when I drew my pinecone. I made a mistake because I drew the pinecone too long, but I turn the pinecone into a leaf. I felt much more confident about my drawing. I felt proud of myself when I was drawing my second pinecone. It made me feel better and forget about my mistake. I am proud that I drew my stick very good. I am proud. It was so much fun in art today.
How do you know when students have developed the habit of self-assessing?
What does self assessment look like?
Art studio. Good morning everyone.

11/16/15

- horizontal
- vertical
- background foreground
- middle ground lines
- short straight vertical
- long curvy
- spiral
- dotted line
- cross hatching
- diagonal
- thick
- thin
- zig-zag

Art 11/25/15 Today I did.....

Today I did engraving printing and I thought I did something wrong. I thought and thought. I knew now it was that I forgot to lift sometimes.
Just give them a couple of minutes.

They want to write! They want to tell you! Just ask them.
An on-demand archive of this webinar will be available at www.edweek.org/go/webinar in less than 24 hrs.
Students in Charge: Self-Assessment and Learning to Learn

Required Reading from *Education Week*:

**Spotlight on Formative Assessment**
Formative assessments can offer educators a powerful approach to personalized learning. In this Spotlight, explore how the common core is changing assessment, how teachers are evaluating and employing formative assessment resources, and how digital tools offer new avenues of assessment.