Substitute Teachers, Diversity, Recruitment, and Retention During Covid-19
Nicola Soares
Senior Vice President, Education Practice, Kelly Services

Holly Kurtz
Director, EdWeek Research Center

Demetrius Davis
Member of the Board of Directors, Grow Your Own Illinois, Grow Your Own Graduate; and Founder and Co-Pastor of City Point Community Church, Chicago, Ill.

Gonzalo La Cava
Chief of Human Resources, The School District of Palm Beach County, West Palm Beach, Fla., and 2020 Leaders To Learn From honoree
An on-demand archive of this webinar will be available at www.edweek.org/go/webinar in less than 24 hrs.
Substitute Teacher Recruitment and Retention are Changing
What Can Districts Do?
The Survey

- Nationally-representative online survey conducted by the EdWeek Research Center
- Winter 2020
- 2,065 respondents, all from public schools/districts:
  - 1,454 school board members
  - 404 principals
  - 99 superintendents
  - 61 district human resources officials
  - 47 district finance/business officials
The Interview Study

▪ Winter 2020

▪ EdWeek Research Center conducted 10 phone interviews

▪ 4-21 minutes per interview

▪ Interviewees included:
  ▪ 5 school board members
  ▪ 4 district leaders
  ▪ 3 principals
Quiz yourself

On an average school day, 8 percent of teachers (about 250,000) are absent. According to our survey, on average, what percentage of teachers are districts able to replace with substitutes?

- 12%
- 31%
- 54%
- 77%
- 91%
Enrollment in teacher preparation programs has declined by one third over the past decade.

The number of teaching positions has increased by 64 percent since the late 1980s.

Researchers project that teacher demand will exceed supply by more than 110,000 positions annually for the foreseeable future.

The coronavirus could create additional demands for substitute teachers.
Quiz yourself

What is the most frequently-reported reason why teacher absence rates are on the rise?

- Declining teacher morale
- Changing teacher demographics: a higher percentage of teachers of our teachers are of child-bearing age and face child care challenges/are on maternity leave
- More professional development scheduled during school hours/more professional development
- Greater need for flexibility/work life balance
- Declining teacher health
Absence Rates Are on The Rise

In the past five years, how, if at all, has your teacher absence rate changed?

- Decreased a lot, 2%
- Decreased a little, 8%
- No change, 34%
- Increased a little, 40%
- Increased a lot, 16%
Meantime, Permanent Teacher Vacancies Are on The Rise....

How has your teacher vacancy rate [rate of unfilled teaching positions] changed over the past five years?

- Stayed the same, 50%
- Increased a little, 20%
- Increased a lot, 17%
- Decreased a little, 6%
- Decreased a lot, 7%
Substitute & Permanent Teacher Shortages: The Connection

Which of the following have occurred as a result of your increasing teacher vacancy rates? Select all that apply.

- Substitute teachers are increasingly filling permanent teacher vacancies: 60%
- Student behavior problems have increased: 51%
- We have lowered our hiring standards for substitute teachers: 47%
- Specialist positions (teachers without their own classrooms) go unfilled: 40%
- We have lowered our hiring standards for permanent teachers: 38%
- We are putting more resources into teacher recruitment: 38%
## Challenges are Not Expected to End Anytime Soon

In the next five years, how, if at all, do you expect the following to change in your district or school?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Decrease</th>
<th>No change</th>
<th>Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The need for substitute teachers</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher vacancy rates</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher absence rates</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of applicants for permanent teaching positions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quality of permanent teacher applicants</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number of applicants for substitute teaching positions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quality of substitute teacher applicants</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Decrease**
- **No change**
- **Increase**
Solutions
Higher Pay?
Quiz yourself

According to our survey, what is the median daily pay rate for a substitute teacher?

- $97
- $131
- $176
- $181
- $193
Despite Increasing Demand, Decreasing Supply, Pay Rates Have Mostly Been Flat

In the past five years, how, if at all, have your substitute teacher pay rates changed?

- Decreased, 1%
- Stayed exactly the same, 29%
- Increased at about the rate of inflation, 52%
- Increased at more than the rate of inflation, 19%
Quiz Yourself

On average, what is MINIMUM pay increase that survey respondents said their districts would need to provide in order to increase the quality of the substitute teachers hired?

- 8%
- 10%
- 26%
- 57%
- More than 100%
## Top 10 Ways to Improve Substitute Teaching, in Order of Popularity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Suggestion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Higher substitute pay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Professional development for substitutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hiring/assigning substitutes with expertise in the field of the absent teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Improving recruitment efforts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Other, please specify</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Professional development for teachers on planning for substitutes and preparing their students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Making/expanding efforts to create a substitute pool with similar demographics to our student population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Improving retention efforts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Requiring substitutes to have teaching experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>A centralized, computerized dashboard that tracks substitute requests, teacher absence reasons, and other data related to substitute teaching</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Most Respondents Say Higher Pay Would Increase Substitute Teacher Quality

In your opinion, would increasing substitute teacher pay increase the quality of your substitute teacher pool?

- Yes, 65%
- No, 35%
Solution: Professional Development
Quiz Yourself

What percentage of survey respondents say their districts provide professional development to substitute teachers?

- 24%
- 33%
- 56%
- 79%
Mismatch: PD Provided Vs. PD Needed

Professional development: What's offered versus what administrators and school board members say should be offered

- Classroom management: 11% would significantly improve substitute teaching in our district, 67% is offered by our district.
- Effective teaching strategies: 8% would significantly improve, 44% is offered.
- Ongoing professional development: 6% would improve, 38% is offered.
- One-time orientation for substitutes new to the district: 6% would improve, 38% is offered.
- District/school-specific policies and procedures: 23% would improve, 33% is offered.
- Working with diverse student populations: 4% would improve, 28% is offered.
- Teacher professionalism: 9% would improve, 28% is offered.
- Proper planning and follow-up: 6% would improve, 25% is offered.
- Educational laws and issues/liability issues: 8% would improve, 17% is offered.
- Other: 4% would improve, 8% is offered.

Would significantly IMPROVE substitute teaching in our district | Offered by our district
Solution: Recruitment & Retention
Quiz Yourself

What percentage of survey respondents say that their district makes NO effort to recruit or retain substitute teachers?

- 16%
- 47%
- 69%
- 90%
Grow-your Own Programs: A Promising Solution

Examples of Approaches

- Teacher cadet programs for the district’s own high school students
- Community-originated and focused programs
- University partnerships
Conclusion
Your Turn!

What do you think would be the most promising and attainable approach to improving substitute teaching in your school district?

- Raising pay
- More/better professional development
- More/better recruitment efforts
- More/better retention efforts
Recommendations

▪ **Providing professional development** that not only improves substitute teachers’ instructional ability but develops classroom management skills that help them avoid burnout and stress resulting from difficulties with student behavior. Remote learning may also be needed if schools continue to close due to the pandemic.

▪ **Implementing basic recruitment and retention tactics** from formally advertising the need for substitute teachers to offering incentives that encourage retention.

▪ **Investing in grow-your-own programs** that prepare districts’ students, parents, para-professionals, and substitute teachers for permanent teaching positions. This approach has the added potential of increasing the level of diversity in the teaching corps as grow-your-owns may reach people who had not previously considered permanently entering the teaching profession.
**Demetrius Davis**  
Member of the Board of Directors, Grow Your Own Illinois, Grow Your Own Graduate; and Founder and Co-Pastor of City Point Community Church, Chicago, Ill.

**Gonzalo La Cava**  
Chief of Human Resources, The School District of Palm Beach County, West Palm Beach, Fla., and [2020 Leaders To Learn From honoree](https://www.edweek.org/)

**Nicola Soares**  
Senior Vice President, Education Practice, Kelly Services

**Q&A**
An on-demand archive of this webinar will be available at www.edweek.org/go/webinar in less than 24 hrs.
Recognized by The NonProfitTimes as one of the 2020 Best Nonprofits to Work For.

Education Week has been selected as one of the 2020 Best Nonprofits To Work For by The NonProfit Times, a leading national business publication for nonprofit managers.

“We are humbled and energized to be selected as one of the top fifty 2020 winners, particularly during these very challenging times,” says president and CEO Michele Givens, who has held a leadership role with Education Week for more than 15 years.

– Michele Givens, President and CEO, Education Week